# ICS Ethics Committee meeting Agenda <br> Wednesday $7^{\text {th }}$ October, Venue: Palais des Congrès <br> Room: 512H <br> Time: 07.00-08.00 

Known Attending: Nina Davis (Chair), Andrew Farkas, Cristina Naranjo Ortiz, Alvaro BedoyaRonga, Suzanne Hagen, Tomas Rosenbaum, Elise De, Safwat Tosson

Known Apologies: Ruwan Fernando
In Attendance: Heidi Moossdorff, Avicia Burchill, David Catro-Diaz

1. Approval of Rio meeting minutes and March Teleconference Minutes (Attached)
2. Introduction of members
3. Terms of Office (Attached)
4. Terms of Reference (Attached)
5. ICS 2016 Programme
6. Ethics Relationship to the Board of Trustees
7. Possible liaison to the PCC
8. Ethics microsite
9. Committee picture
10. AOB

# Ethics Committee Meeting Minutes 

$21^{\text {st }}$ of October 2014

## Venue: SulAmérica Convention Center

Attendees: Safwat Tosson (Deputy Chair), Tom Rosenbaum, Ruwan Fernando, Christina Naranjo-Ortiz, Elise De, Suzanne Hagen

Apologies: Nina Davis, Andrew Farkas, Alvaro Bedoya-Ronga

- The Ethics committee met and was quorate according to the rules.
- Committee members wish to continue playing a constructive, supportive and independent role in the ICS.
- Members would like to continue with the commitment of Ethical education at the annual Lecture.
- Committee members agreed to submit an abstract for an ethics workshop at the 2015 ICS meeting.


## Action: Committee to submit an Ethics workshop abstract for ICS 2015

- Members discussed and propose an update to the terms of reference, currently dated 2006. The recommendations were:

1. We recommend that the Ethics Lecture is more widely published.
2. Item 3 to issue positional statements relevant to ethical issues
3. Make ourselves available to the scientific committee when asked.
4. At all times we aim to function as committee.
5. We are committed to one yearly face to face meeting and twice yearly teleconference
6. We would like to remind members to update their disclosure statement on renewing their membership and prior to the annual meeting.
7. We would like to remind membership and chairs to adhere to the disclosure statement.
8. Members wish to extend their membership to the committee.

## Action: Committee to review terms of reference.

## Meeting Ends

Attendees: Nina Davis (Chair), Suzanne Hagen, Andrew Farkas, Ruwan Fernando, Tom Rosenbaum.
Apologies: Alvaro Bedoya-Rong
Also in attendance: Jenny Ellis

## 1. Approval of Rio and Teleconference minutes

ND asked committee to approve. SH first, TR second.

## 2. Number and composition of EC

ND advised that David Castro-Diaz has been assigned to the committee in an ex-officio capacity. ND wanted to make committee aware of this as he might be involved in committee calls going forward. TR thinks that committee needs to be independent of the Board. AF thinks this is a negative response, having a trustee liaising with the committee would be beneficial. TR I think the liaison will hamper the work of the committee. JE advised that this role is to assist the committee and strengthen communication. ND no hand over from Ed so not sure of any past issues, communications with Board, in relation to this but I think it will work well. TR thinks the purpose of the committee is not to have interference with external communications e.g. pharmaceutical, WHO, Board etc.

ND read the purpose of David on the committee asked Jenny to send to all committee members.

## Action: Send Board info to all committee members.

Postscript: Please see below correspondence from David:

Subject: Committee's Trustee liaison
To Nina Davis
Chair of the ICS Ethics Committee
Dear Nina
Following on from the Committee Consultation in 2014 and the Board of Trustee meeting in January, I am emailing you to confirm that I will be your Committee's Trustee liaison. My role is to assist your committee (as a non-voting member) to improve communication between the Board and Committees, in both directions. I will therefore have the dual role of advocating the work of your committee and ensuring that committee work is governed within the strategic direction of the ICS.

My responsibilities include:

- Attendance at formal meetings of the committee (face to face and teleconference)
- Keeping abreast of committee activity by involvement in email discussions, projects and in reading all minutes and reports.
- Formal report of committee activities to Board. These will not replace the formal committee reports of the Chair.
- Formal report on Board activities to the committee.
- To act as source of ad hoc advice to Chairmen of committees.
- To act as lead trustee for annual revisions to your committee's terms of reference document. To work with the committee Chair to ensure the terms of reference fit committee and ICS strategy.

Jenny will shortly be adding me to your committee member's page so that I can be involved in the day to day discussions of the group. I therefore wanted to highlight this to you before I am added on to the page.

Should you have any questions regarding this change or your committee's projects then please do not hesitate in contacting me.

## Kind regards

David Castro-Diaz

SH asked if the remit is the same for all committees? ND confirmed that it was. TR thinks that it changes the ethics committee. ND thinks what's being asked is reasonable. TR thinks that the committee needs to be independent to do their role, this should be discussed at AGM. AF thinks it may change the committee for the better, we may have more to do. I don't think it would be unreasonable to ask to discuss our work privately. JE thinks it would be possible to ask David to step out if you need to discuss issues without Board involvement. ND we have a new GS and strategy, it's changing, our committee has done a fantastic job in Rio and we need to see how it goes with the liaison. ND proposed that the committee wait and see, see how it goes, the Board of Trustees are trying too and trying to get the ICS moving forward. TR asked what everyone thinks? SH agrees with Nina, need to wait and see. ND asked if TR wants to make a motion? TR yes, this needs to be discussed at the AGM further.

## Action: Discuss the role of the committee and Board of Trustees liaison at the AGM

TR I feel this changes the essence of the committee and our meetings and should be known to the membership. JE advised that maybe a call with Adrian and David would be beneficial, it would clarify the role and the committee can voice their concerns- before it goes to the membership. RF agrees clarification would be useful. TR concerned that the committee might not be seen as impartial to the membership as we have a member of the Board on it. ND thinks this would be a good idea to discuss this further. TR doesn't have an issue with executive sitting in and not voting but would like to reserve the right to voice concerns during the meeting. Need to clarify that ex-officio is nonvoting?

## Action: Office to check that ex-officio is non-voting.

## Post script note:

Page 2 of the ICS bylaws: General Secretary is a non-voting ex-officio member of all ICS committees. Therefore a member of the Board on a committee as ex-officio would be non-voting.

## 2. TOR

ND before we change our TOR we need to discuss the composition of the committee. RF which speciality is missing? SH missing a nurse. ND would the committee like a nurse or paediatric member? Some committees have geriatrician or trainee members, so something to consider. TR what does the executive want us to do (projects), ND doing annual meeting project. What happens if work load increases? ND just asking committee based on TOR, all aspects. ND we have the opportunity to co-opt people for projects, so we can have expertise on projects. TR so you think we need to be seen to be more representative? ND I think a nurse offers a different perspective for the committee. TR more young people is very important. ND agrees, just thinking of ideas, we don't want the committee to get too big.

## Motion: Membership at 10 people and amend page 2, 1 other rather than 2.

## Second: SH. All in favour- yes. Passed.

SH what happens if no one from that discipline applies? Do we take anyone? ND yes, I think so. Trustees have introduced a criteria to assist committee when choosing people to join, so we can use that to help select the best person for the job.

## Action: JE to specify nurse/ paediatric specialist/other/scientist in nominations.

ND preference in another scientist, asked if SH staying on after Montreal? SH yes, I have a 1 year extension. Doug Small suggested by AF. SH suggested Jim. ND asked members to ask people to apply.

ND reviewed TOR functions, committee suggested moving the functions around. Nina feels that educational is missing, AF 5 is educational. ND thinks needs to be broader and number 1, most people thought it should be 2 or 3 . AF thinks 5 should be 3 and broader, 1 and 2 should be moved around. SH how would it be broader, year round courses? ND wasn't thinking year round but good idea. AF can organise an on-going educational programme in line with the ICS strategic aims and AGM. ND settling any ethical questions coming up during the year. AF happy to keep 4 further down the list, ND this is part of the bylaws. ND agrees nearer the bottom. TR does the order matter? ND thinks it does. TR thinks as long as it is in the terms of reference then it doesn't matter. ND thinks there's too many points, $4 \& 7$ should be combined. AF thinks they should be separate and kept in same order.

ND outlined 3 aims of strategy: education, finance and science.
JE suggested educational could be short videos or articles for ICS news and social media. This would be good for committee and ICS publications. ND agreed this would be good educational content.

Amend point 3- shouldn't be based on Board of Trustees, should just be time to time. Don't need to wait to be asked, just do it when see fit. "as the committee see's fit and as requested by the Board of Trustees."

ND need to include maintaining the values of ICS.
ND is purpose sufficient? All members happy with the wording. ND composition- amend GS to GS or designated Board rep. ND asked if we need subcommittees? All think not! SH thinks that whilst we shouldn't have subcommittee, projects should be split into smaller groups. ND agrees, not a subcommittee but a group working together.

Meetings: Don't need to specify number of meetings but should add teleconferences and emails to the TOR- all agree. AF thinks the teleconference work well and very easy to use. ND thanked the office for arranging calls.

JE confirmed the process for minutes- goes to chair for review and then to the committee ( 2 weeks to review), final changes and then goes to chair and final version emailed to all committee members.

## Motion- to amend TOR as discussed above. SH second, all in favour- all.

## 3. Review of activities for ICS 2015. (1 ${ }^{\text {st }}$ June- reminder will be sent from office)

Ethics workshop- RF attending FIGO. SH unable to attend Montreal. ND asked for substitute speakers. JE to confirm the deadline for final speakers- to ensure printing is correct.

JE to arrange for deadline to be sent to Nina.

## Action: JE to check deadlines and confirm to ND.

ND Peter Rosier speaking at the debate, Nina doing introduction. Cases will be discussed- selected by speakers.

ND basic science- where all our work will be focused, RF will you be involved in the ethics cases? RF yes, think members should suggest cases. Committee discussed FGM case. Elise De wanted to discuss this as one of our cases- thoughts? Mixed view from committee.

Action: ND to send out reminders on committee role and syllabus for ICS 2015

## 4. Thanks to reviewers

ND thanked all reviewers for their assistance.

## 5. Ethics cases for Basic Ethics Course

ND need suggestions from members, personally feel 1 end of life case and 2 other case. 310 minute discussions. Suggested 1 research 1 end of life and 1 other. TR thinks needs to be based on real life issues- not necessarily continence but that would be preferable. ND suggested we can bank one's not used. ND asked members to email the details to her.

## 6. New business

No.

## 7. Establish a rough date for our next teleconference.

ND suggested 3 teleconferences per year. 1 before the course- end of May/beginning June. $2^{\text {nd }}$ call August-need to start planning for 2016. Any objections? TR thinks that committee members very busy, need clear important items to deal with. AF I think face to face plus 2 teleconference fine. Then emails.

## Call Ends

Ethics Committee Terms of Office

| Member | Role | Term Start | Term End | Term Yrs | Elected | Term details | Additional Information |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Nina Davis | Chair | 23-Oct-14 | 14-Sep-17 | 3 | Y | 3 year term will finish in 2017-can be reelected by formal election |  |
| Andrew Farkas | Committee member | 02-Oct-09 | 08-Oct-15 | 6 | N | Second 3 year term end 2015 - cannot renew |  |
| Safwat Tosson | Committee member | 02-Oct-09 | 08-Oct-15 | 7 | N | Second 3 year term end 2015 - cannot renew | Board confirmed 1 year extension 15/12/14 |
| Suzanne Hagen | Committee member | 02-Oct-09 | 08-Oct-15 | 7 | N | Second 3 year term end 2015 - cannot renew | Board confirmed 1 year extension 15/12/14 |
| Tom Rosenbaum | Committee member | 02-Oct-09 | 08-Oct-15 | 6 | N | Second 3 year term end 2015 - cannot renew |  |
| Christina Ortiz | Committee member | 29-Aug-13 | 15-Sep-16 | 3 | N | 3 year term will finish in 2015. Can renew |  |
| Ruwan Fernando | Committee member | 23-Oct-14 | 14-Sep-17 | 3 | N | 3 year term will finish in 2017- can Renew |  |
| Alvaro Bedoya Ronga | Committee member | 23-Oct-14 | 14-Sep-17 | 3 | N | 3 year term will finish in 2017- can Renew |  |
| Elise De | Committee member | 23-Oct-14 | 14-Sep-17 | 3 | N | 3 year term will finish in 2017- can Renew |  |
| Heidi Moossdorff- <br> Steinhauser | Committee member | 08-Oct-15 | 25-Oct-18 | 3 | N | 3 year term will finish in 2018-can renew |  |
| David Castro-Diaz | Ex-officio | 25-Feb-15 | 14-Sep-17 | 2 | N | Ex-officio |  |

Nominations 2016
Andrew Farkas, Safwat Tosson, Suzanne Hagen and Tom Rosenbaum will step down in Montreal
Christina Ortiz will need to confirm whether she wishes to renew for another 3 years, in Montreal.

| Key |  |
| :--- | :--- |
| Colour | Meaning |
|  | Stepping down in Montreal |
|  | Stepping down in Tokyo |
|  | Elect position- will need to re- <br> apply |
|  | Will need to confirm if renewing/ <br> positions will need to be <br> advertised after Montreal |
|  | New member/position |

## ICS Ethics Committee Terms of Reference

1. PURPOSE: To maintain proper conduct of ICS in matters of ethical consideration.

## 2. FUNCTIONS:

i. Develop a fair, disclosure policy regarding "conflicts of interest" for ICS members, officers, and meeting participants.
ii. Develop policies to ensure that all research presented to the society is carried out in compliance with basic international ethical standards for the conduct of human and animal research
iii. Develop position papers on ethical matters as required from time to time by the ICS Board of Trustees and Chair of ICS
iv. Provide advice from time to time on specific ethical questions as requested by the ICS Board of Trustees and General Secretary
v. Organise an annual educational programme on ethical issues relevant to the interests of the ICS in conjunction with each year's annual scientific meeting
vi. Serve as a conduit for conveying the views and opinions on ethical issues from the membership to the ICS Board of Trustees and ICS Chairs and vice-versa.
vii. Undertake such additional matters as may from time to time be required of the Committee by the ICS Board of Trustees and Chair of ICS
3. RESPONSIBLE TO: ICS Board of Trustees and ICS General Secretary
4. COMPOSITION:

| Total Members | Method of Appointment | Name | Term of Office |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| General Secretary | Ex officio | See <br> Membership <br> Page | 3 years |
| Chair: | Elected. <br> A member must sign his/her agreement to stand. This nomination is signed by nominator and seconder, all being ICS members. The Chair would normally have served as a committee member, either current or in the past. Nominations received by April 1st as advertised. Voting regulations as stated. | See <br> Membership <br> Page | Term of office: 3 years, renewable once by formal election |
| Membership | All members of ICS committees must be active ICS members (paid for current membership year) (By-law 2.3.2) <br> 9 members each with 3 year term of office, 3 retiring each year ensuring a regular rotation through the committee. <br> The optimum representation is 10 Committee members formed preferably from the following: | See <br> Membership <br> Page | 3 years, renewable once by <br> Chair/committee approval. <br> Further terms could be approved in exceptional |


|  | 2 gynaecologists, <br> 2 urologist, <br> 1 geriatrician, <br> 1 physiotherapist, <br> 1 nurse, <br> 1 scientist, <br> 1 clinician with a paediatric interest <br> 2 others | circumstances <br> and by referral <br> to the ICS <br> Trustees. |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Subcommittees (if <br> any) | None |  |  |
| Updated January <br> 2014 |  |  |  |

5. MEETINGS: One face-to-face meeting during the Annual Scientific meeting; Other deliberations normally by email.
6. QUORUM: One third of committee membership plus one. For example, a committee of ten will have a quorum of four members.
7. MINUTES: Minutes are recorded at each meeting and posted on the ICS and CPC website in accordance to 2009 ICS Bylaw 6.1-6.4).
8. REPORTING \& ROLES:

The Chair is responsible to the Board of Trustees, and to the members of the ICS at the AGM. The Chair must table a report at the AGM and be available to answer comments from members. The Report will be available to members 6 weeks ahead of the AGM so members can come prepared. The Chair should not read out the Report at the AGM but draw attention to important areas. If important issues should arise during the year, the Chair must advise the General Secretary, without delay.

For Terms of Office Information please see Membership Page

